

FRED FRIENDLY SEMINARS, INC.
ETHICS IN AMERICA II
MY BROTHER'S KEEPER
MODERATOR: CHARLES OGLETREE
PRODUCER: PAMELA MASON WAGNER
FINAL TRANSCRIPT
8.21.06

FRANK: There may be people on this panel who have never lied under any circumstances. I salute you. Everybody else I know has.

OAKS: You worry about the consequences of one lie which commits you to another lie and so it's not enough to say it's only a small lie in service of a large good.

MOORE: We're not willing to sacrifice the truth and our integrity and his moral development for the sake of his school.

CROUCH: I got the impression that this girl who comes over here is coming in your house and taking her clothes off and you're doing something with her and I don't want to be part of it.

OGLETREE: Wait a minute!

CONWAY: I'm interested that a number of people seem to feel that the sexual behavior and conduct of their neighbors is their business.

RODGERS: All of a sudden, now that I'm in the position of power, now all of a sudden I have ethics? I don't think so.

VOICEOVER: The situations are hypothetical but the dilemmas are real.

From the boardroom to the bedroom; from the court room to the classroom. Men and women put their values to the test as they struggle with the kinds of decisions we face everyday. Fred Friendly Seminars presents "Ethics in America." This hour: My Brother's Keeper.

Funding for this program is provided by Annenberg Media.

Ethics in America is a presentation of the Fred Friendly Seminars at the Columbia University Graduate School of Journalism.

OGLETREE: Denise Rodgers, your son Jason needs you to take a look at his college application essay. Mom, take a look at it?

RODGERS: No problem.

OGLETREE: Great. And, you look at it, and it needs some work. It needs a lot of work. A new introduction. A new subject matter. A lot of grammatical errors. And misuse of words. Talk to Jason.

RODGERS: Son, I'm a little disappointed in this. You know, I'm not sure that the subject that you've chosen is one that's going to sort of present you in the best light. So, I'd like you to go back and think about it a little bit more. And, maybe write another draft so that I can look at it again.

OGLETREE: Mom, there's a lot of pressure. I just need your help to make this work.

RODGERS: I'm gonna help you. But, this-- this first draft just-- it doesn't show enough of how

well you can do. I'll help you edit that next version though. I really will.

OGLETREE: And, Jason works on it. It-- it doesn't really get better. Here's the problem.
Tomorrow's the deadline for this application.

RODGERS: Yes. (LAUGHTER)

OGLETREE: And, you know that if he submits this application to this college, it's gonna sink
him.

RODGERS: Right.

OGLETREE: What do you do?

RODGERS: I'm gonna help him a lot 'cause Jason, you know, this is-- this has been our problem
is this waiting till the last minute. It isn't that I don't know you can do better.

OGLETREE: Right.

RODGERS: You can. But, we're up against the wall now. And, this is about your future.

OGLETREE: Well, I appreciate that, Mom. And-- and I-- I think I've got an idea if you will help
me--I'm going to-- tell you my ideas. And, if you sit down at the computer, then you can
type them up and then you can put the things in the right order so that I can get an essay
out of this.

RODGERS: Yeah. Now, we've crossed the line. So-- Jason, you know I love you and I want the
best for your future. But, I'm not writing your essay for you.

OGLETREE: I'm asking you to help, Mom. This is important.

RODGERS: This is extremely important. So, we're gonna talk through your ideas. If you have a problem with a correct usage of word, I'm gonna help you with that. But, I'm not writing this for you, Jason.

OGLETREE: Oh, Dad. Glad you made it home. How are you? (LAUGHTER)

PASSARO: I-- I-- I've been working hard, son.

OGLETREE: Oh gosh. Mom and I are talking about this essay. You know tomorrow's the day it's due. You want to talk to her about what we've just talked about?

PASSARO: Well, what does Jason need?

RODGERS: Well, unfortunately, he needs a total rewrite. You know, this is classic Jason. He waits till the very last minute. (LAUGHTER) The deadline is tomorrow. He's written this thing without a whole lot of thought. And, personally, I think he needs to learn a lesson now. I mean, clearly this is gonna be an all nighter for all of us. We're all gonna be up all night doing this. But, I don't think we can write it for him. And, that's what he's asking me to do.

PASSARO: Somebody's gonna have to stand in the room with him while his fingers are on the keyboard to get this done.

RODGERS: That's right. And, I think as his father, that's your job. (LAUGHTER)

OGLETREE: Dad, you-- you have any sympathy at all for my dilemma? I mean, tomorrow's the day. And, I've been workin' real hard. I've really been trying.

PASSARO: I have sympathy. And, I'll tell you this-- the essay is not the be-all and end-all. It rarely gets you in, but it can definitely sink you.

OGLETREE: So, would you sit down at the computer, Dad?

PASSARO: Hell, no.

OGLETREE: Why?

PASSARO: You're gonna sit at the computer. And, I'm gonna stand there while you type.

OGLETREE: Dad--

PASSARO: You tell me what's in your head. Just say it out loud, and I will tell you whether that's a typeable sentence.

OGLETREE: Dad, dad, dad--

RODGERS: Now honey, I-- I want us though to make an agreement that we're gonna give him till 3 AM. And, if he hasn't come up with a good essay by 3 AM, we really are gonna have to, you know-- I mean, this is his future.

OGLETREE: Yes, all right, Mom.

RODGERS: This is-- you didn't hear this. This is between dad and me. You don't know that we made this agreement.

OGLETREE: It feels good anyway.

RODGERS: But, you know, this is what we're gonna have to do because, if he sends that nonsense in like it is now, there is no way he's going to college.

PASSARO: Well, if you want to sit and write it for him, I'm not gonna write it for him.

RODGERS: I want him to sweat. And, I want him to do his best. But, there's too much at stake. And, quite frankly, I-- I feel a little guilt in this myself. You know, I've got a lot of stuff going on at work right now. And so, you know, I haven't been able to sit down with him over the past several months to get this done.

OGLETREE: Okay. Let me ask you, Stanley Crouch. Dad, you're a great writer. You know my problem. Can't you help me get this thing in?

CROUCH: No, maybe not the way you want me to help you.

OGLETREE: How are you gonna help me, Dad?

CROUCH: By reading and by criticizing it.

OGLETREE: Oh, and then, you'll write in what it should say?

CROUCH: No, no, no, no, no. Think of all those things as preludes to starting, that you're building yourself up. Just like you're going to the gym and you're getting ready to perform.

I know the choices you're facing 'cause it's the same one I face at-- if I-- if I don't make a deadline, then I don't get paid.

OGLETREE: But, you're an adult. I'm just a kid, Dad.

CROUCH: Oh, that doesn't change anything. I mean, the rules start early on you. And, for you, they're starting now.

OGLETREE: I just can't believe how unhelpful my family has been. (LAUGHTER) Uncle Barney, how you doin'?

FRANK: All right.

OGLETREE: Good, good. Can you help me? You know, about-- my parents just don't understand me. You do. You're my favorite uncle.

FRANK: I think we have figured out that it's probably not a good idea for you to go to college right away. You probably ought to go to work 'cause here's the deal: I can't go to college with you. This pressure that you're now facing, you're gonna face on a regular basis in college. And it would be a great mistake to send you off there, ready to fail.

OGLETREE: But, you know, there is a friend of ours who's also applying to college. And her wealthy family has hired a consultant to craft the essay, been working with her for months. And, she's competing for the same space that I'm competing for in this college. Is it fair to me, Jason, that no one's gonna help me the way that she's been helped?

FRANK: Well, there are a lot of things that are unfair. It's probably unfair from your standpoint that-- her parents are a lot wealthier than we are-- than your parents are. So, no. I think this is a question of-- of what's good for you.

OGLETREE: Okay. All right-- Jason, goes off and-- works on it. And, you read the first paragraph. It's terrific. And, the second paragraph is just outstanding. And, the third paragraph is just amazing. You just can't believe it, that this is Jason. It's really clicking.

But, you can't believe it's really Jason. You're not 100 percent sure. But, you're more and more suspicious that maybe Jason didn't write this essay. Hey, Mom.

RODGERS: Jason, I read your essay, and it is phenomenal.

OGLETREE: Thanks, Mom. Thanks. I'm glad you liked it.

RODGERS: Just amazing. Did you write it?

OGLETREE: What do you mean?

RODGERS: Well, it's such a turn around from where you were yesterday. And, quite frankly, it doesn't sound like the voice that you've used in other essays that you've had to write for school.

OGLETREE: But, you told me to go work on this. And, I did exactly what you asked me, and now you're challenging me?

RODGERS: Yeah.

OGLETREE: Why?

RODGERS: I need to know. I-- I want to be sure, Jason, that-- that you really wrote this.

OGLETREE: Well, I-- I can't believe after all this, Mom, that you don't trust me as your son. I'm outta here.

RODGERS: Where are you going? You don't have any money. You-- you'll be back.

(LAUGHTER)

OGLETREE: Is that the response, Dad?

PASSARO: I'm with Mom. If-- if I-- if I search the internet, Jay, am I gonna find any of these-- any of this language?

OGLETREE: You don't trust me?

PASSARO: I'm asking you a question. You can answer it yes or no.

OGLETREE: Well, I'm asking you a question--

PASSARO: Clearly--

OGLETREE: Do you not trust me? Your son?

PASSARO: Clearly, we're both readin' this essay, Jason. And, we're lookin' at it goin'-- as your parents, who know you better than anyone's gonna know you in your life, we don't think you wrote this.

OGLETREE: Rabbi Zemel, let me ask you about this iss-- issues of trust and loyalty. How are you reacting to what you're hearing the parents say to Jason?

ZEMEL: I agree with the parents. I think we have to teach our children honesty before we teach them anything else. Integrity is everything in the world.

OGLETREE: Alright. Well, Jason leaves. In fact, he had a planned bike trip. But, fortunately-- for you, Vince-- a good friend of yours who actually runs a computer company is coming by to help you with a computer problem that you have at your house. So, you tell him

about this agony with Jason. And, this computer friend tells you, you know what? Let me see your computer 'cause I could take a look at it, look at your son's essay, and let you know whether or not it's on the internet.

PASSARO: Yeah. I have no pro-- I would have searched the internet already probably.

OGLETREE: Okay. Sounds right, Victoria?

TOENSING: I have no problem.

OGLETREE: And, Jill, are you going to accept this friend's offer to look on the computer to see if your son has plagiarized his essay?

CONWAY: I would not.

OGLETREE: And, tell us why not?

CONWAY: I would not because I want to keep the problem we have as a family in our family and between us. And, I would simply say to Jason, I am absolutely convinced that this is not your writing. You can tell me that you faked it, and I will respond as lovingly and caringly as I can. I will not go double check on you because I want you to tell me what you have done.

OGLETREE: Victoria, do you agree with her?

TOENSING: No, I don't because I think it's good-- this is the lawyer in me-- to say, here's some evidence. And, Jason, if you do something that's wrong, if you do something that's unethical, every so often you're gonna have to wake up at two o'clock in the morning and wonder if somebody's gonna find the evidence of that.

OGLETREE: All right, you search the-- key words, key phrases. And, you look. It's inconclusive. But, you know what? Your computer friend tells you, "Your son has a laptop, right?"

TOESNING: Correct.

OGLETREE: If-- you can get me access to his laptop in his bedroom, I can go and check, and we can get the final answer. Will you do that?

TOENSING: I see no difference. Yes, I'll do that.

OGLETREE: Okay, right. So, we can go and do that, right? Dad, you'd do the same thing?

PASSARO: No, I wouldn't do that.

OGLETREE: Talk to mom. Help me here.

PASSARO: You know, I-- I got a problem with that. -- I'm not going into his room and onto his computer. That's just crossing the line...you know.

TOENSING: I wouldn't open the drawers to look for something. He has a computer. We know it. I'm not looking for something that he's put away and secreted.

PASSARO: Computers-- computers are drawers beyond your wildest imagine-

TOENSING: You have a responsibility to him to find out whether he's trying to put-- play a little game with us because if we don't teach him this now, he's going to do this kind of dishonesty throughout his life.

OGLETREE: Randy, you're the father. What would you do?

COHEN: I-- I-- I think Jason has failed to understand how difficult cheating is. I think I failed as a father if I haven't gotten across that lesson that it's hard to be a thief. That he has to work harder if he wants to be a thief and a cheat. There is-- it's a very demanding line of work. And, that-- that college admissions are--

OGLETREE: How do you know that, Dad? (LAUGHTER)

COHEN: You know, what goes on in Vegas University stays in Vegas University. That-- that college admission officers are not idiots. They read thousands and thousands of these essays.

And-- and it's-- becomes immediately apparent-- who-- who's plagiarized an essay. If Jason wants to enter the challenging field of cheating, he will find he must work much, much, much harder. I would respect his privacy. I would not go-- through his drawers-- virtual or actual.

OGLETREE: You wouldn't go to the laptop.

COHEN: Oh, absolutely not. No. No. That-- that-- the-- the notion that there's a lesson to be taught here about, "Oh, you shouldn't cheat," he knows that. You're not gonna--

OGLETREE: But, what's wrong with the laptop? If he's guilty, you prove it. If he's innocent, there's no harm.

COHEN: That's right. That's why we should trample all our rights because we know they're guilty. In fact, I might have him sent to Egypt where he would be tortured because I know he's guilty.

And, if it turns out he's guilty, well surely that torture was okay. And, you know, it teaches him a valuable lesson. (LAUGHTER) The valuable lesson is--

OGLETREE: (OVERTALK) Elder Dallin Oaks is shakin' your head (LAUGHTER)

COHEN: --if you're guilty, anything--

OGLETREE: What is at stake here, Elder?

OAKS: What's at stake is moral development of my son. And, I don't think it would help me as a teacher of moral development if I were to invade his privacy. Or if I were to bring in a-- a neighbor with computer skills that I lack. I think I need to work this out with my son over a period of time. Whatever it takes. And, see that he is guided and helped to make the decisions that he needs to make to be a responsible member of the community. And, I surely agree with his Uncle Barney's advice that you not send a-- a boy to college to fail.

OGLETREE: Mom, I'm glad you're here because, I'm back from the bike trip. And-- I didn't write the essay. My girlfriend Olivia wrote it.

I mean, she's a good writer and it captures what I was trying to do. As you know, the deadline-- was last night. So, once it was finished-- I sent it. I hit that instant on-line button. And, all my applications to all the universities-- are now there. So, it's done, but I'm-- I'm really sorry that I used Olivia to do the essay.

CONWAY: Well, son-- I'm afraid you're gonna have to-- tell all those schools you applied to that it wasn't your work. And, ask if you can submit something late.

OGLETREE: Dad, can you help me here?

MOORE: You're gonna have to withdraw the application. Absolutely.

OGLETREE: Now, how am I gonna do that?

MOORE: You have to notify the admissions offices to every university to which you applied.

And, you're going to let them know that you're withdrawing your application for this year. And—

OGLETREE: Every place?

MOORE: --you'll work for Uncle Barney for a year.

OGLETREE: All these places, I'm gonna go back and say that I submitted false--

MOORE: Absolutely. You certainly are.

OGLETREE: I'll never get into college.

MOORE: Well--

CONWAY: Well, you'd be surprised. People will-- will be astonished that somebody actually had the personal-- integrity to admit this.

OGLETREE: Well, my favorite college is State University. And, Dean Crouch is there.

OGLETREE: All right. There he is, Mom.

CROUCH: So, what problem do we have here with your son? (LAUGHTER)

CONWAY: Our son faked his essay in his application. And, we believe it's very important for us as a family and for him that we address that problem right away. We know that he is a good student in other respects. But, he has failed us and himself here.

CROUCH: Does he use drugs?

CONWAY: Not that I know.

CROUCH: Is he a thief?

CONWAY: In respect of taking somebody else's work, he is.

CROUCH: Well, that's not exactly a thief. You did say that his girlfriend--

CONWAY: Yeah.

CROUCH: --did it for him. So, she-- that's sort of a present to him.

MOORE: He's-- he's a liar. And, that's what we're concerned--

CROUCH: Oh yes. Well-- (LAUGHTER) that is a bit of a problem.

MOORE: Right. (LAUGHTER)

CROUCH: Now, here's the-- now, here's the thing: If you-- as far as I'm concerned, he can do it again, if you all can get—

No, no, no, no, no, no. You all can work with him to do another submission of a letter.

That I don't mind. The thing I'm interested in is whether or not you all can influence him

to handle his business better. The problem is whether or not, like you said earlier, and you said, whether or not the student has integrity.

MOORE: And, that's why we're asking you to not make an exception for him. We want him to resubmit his essay. But, we want him to do it at the next regularly appointed time for a submission of essay.

OGLETREE: Let me ask you, Vince, what would you have said?

PASSARO: What I'm concerned about, Jason, your application's gone off.

OGLETREE: Yes.

PASSARO: Olivia wrote it. You should marry her by the way. But, that's not the main thing.

(LAUGHTER) I want you-- to feel bad. I want you to know in your heart-- and-- and whether it-- it ends up we-- you know, with you-- you have to make some serious decisions about yourself here.

You panicked at the last minute. And, you did something that, if you look inside 'cause I know you from when you were this big, you know you didn't want to do.

OGLETREE: So, what do you want me to do now?

PASSARO: I-- I want to know what you're feeling?

OGLETREE: I'm feeling terrible. That's why I told you. Olivia wrote the essay.

PASSARO: And, what do you think is the proper approach?

OGLETREE: It's-- it's in. I don't know what I can do now.

PASSARO: What do you think about going and withdrawing that application.

OGLETREE: Dad, I'm not going to that college and admit this. Are you gonna force Jason to go?

PASSARO: I-- I don't know yet.

OGLETREE: Why?

PASSARO: Because on the one hand-- to-- to take him at this age and drag him by his ear-- in there-- is to have shown him how rules get enforced. But, what I really want to accomplish here is to find out what has happened to him morally. And, to get to the heart of that. And, to help him solve the problem.

OGLETREE: Well, let me-- let me talk about another family—Randy Cohen, you're a parent. And, you're a handyman doing work for this particular family. Your child is about to enter first grade. Where you actually live, schools are absolutely terrible. Terrible. And, this neighborhood where you work, schools are good. And, in fact, one of the people who you work for, they've actually volunteered-- to let you use their address so that your child will be able to go to this school-- and get this quality education that he could not receive where you live. Who's that volunteer that's gonna let-- Randy's kid come and-- use their address?

RODGERS: I'll do it. Randy, you worked for us for a long time. And-- you and I both know that quality education is critical in the development of children in this society. My husband and I, we are so fond of you and your wife. And, we're grateful for the work that you do around the house for us. And-- you know, if you want to put down our address-- to use for-- for your-- your daughter to-- to go to school-- in our neighborhood school, we're

willing to-- to do that for you.

COHEN: I've already filled out the applications just that way. The idea that local school district lines have some kind of moral weight is insane. It sentences the poor to-- to third rate education.

This is not a moral boundary. This is-- this is an administrative convenience. And, the idea that-- 'cause I live down the block from you, my child can't get a good education is so offensive that my obligations as a parent compel me to do this.

OGLETREE: Before you conclude this deal, you should at least talk to your wife, Anita, and see how she feels about it? Tell her the good news!

COHEN: Anita, this is great. Instead of our kids having to go to the third rate school that-- that our society sends poor kids to, we get to s-- send the kids to a decent school. We do have to tell a lie. And, every lie has a social cost and I regret that we have to lie about the address. But, my employer is letting us use her-- her address for-- for-- Billy Bob's-- I'm sorry we named him Billy Bob, by the way.

ALLEN: Isn't that a terrible choice? I mean-- (LAUGHTER)

COHEN: I don't know what--

ALLEN: --Billy Bob. Well--

COHEN: But, is that okay with you?

ALLEN: Absolutely, not. I'm insulted and I'm infuriated you would think that we should rely upon our rich employer to solve our problems.

Let's go down to the school district and point out this problem. That we were tempted to

lie on our application to-- in order to get our kid into better-- in better school down the street. But, we're not gonna do that. We're gonna let them know why. We're gonna publicize this problem--

COHEN: But, the school district can't change it. We have to take this to the people of our town. And, the people of our state. That's who's-- the school district doesn't--

ALLEN: Okay, I'm all for you. But, not for-- for lying. (OVERTALK)

OGLETREE: I'm surprised this family's so divided here. Let me go to another family.
(LAUGHTER) Handyman--

MOORE: Yes.

OGLETREE: --and wife-- talk about the offer you've gotten from Dr. Rodgers to actually use her address.

MOORE: I'm not supportive of that. That would be teaching--

OGLETREE: Talk to your wife.

MOORE: That would be teaching Billy Bob that it's all right to lie. We're-- we're lying. I'm not saying the rule is correct. But-- but our lying about it is teaching him something about his moral development that I think is unhealthy.

TOESNING: Well, now I know why we're married because I agree with you. (LAUGHTER)
But, I think what we ought to do is see if there is something that we could work out.

MOORE: We could ask her if-- if she-- we-- we've been doing such good work for her for so

long, it's time for a raise.

OGELTREE: Oh no. She's at the limit. That's not gonna work.

MOORE: Well, then-- then we're not-- we're not going to-- we're not going to sacrifice the truth and our integrity and his moral development for the sake of his school. (OVERTALK)

OGLETREE: Well, let-- let me ask-- Jill, would you, as-- as the mother, what would you do with this five-year-old going to first grade?

CONWAY: Actually, I would take advantage of the offer because I believe the whole system of-- funding schools today and the way the boundaries are drawn-- is-- is one that it is not a moral problem to subvert.

OGLETREE: It's a-- it's a legal problem, right? Is it a ethical problem?

CONWAY: I don't see it as an ethical problem because my obligation as a parent, trumps many other-- obligations I must fulfill. And, I have a friend who is willing to help me. And, I will take advantage of that. (OVERTALK)

OGLETREE: Let me-- let me ask Elder-- Dallin Oaks-- what's the ethical dilemma here? Is this an ethical dilemma that you see? How-- how would you respond to it?

OAKS: Yes, it is an ethical dilemma. There are two competing goods. But, I think-- anyone who wants to take advantage of-- of Denise's offer needs to think about how far they will go because as soon as you commit yourself to lie about where this child resides, then you are really committing yourself to a succession of lies should the matter be investigated. And, if you pick up one end of that stick, you better know that you're picking up the other end of the stick. How far are you willing to go with this succession of lies? If you are

asked whether you consented to this false representation of fact, are you ready to lie under oath to defend it? That I think is-- is what needs to be thought about at this point.

OGLETREE: You're just worried about get-- being caught?

OAKS: No.

CROUCH: There's-- that's another issue.

OAKS: You're worrying about the consequences of one lie which commits you to another lie.

And so, it's not enough to say it's only a small lie in service of a large good.

(OVERTALK)

FRANK: First, there may be people on this panel who have never lied under any circumstances.

I salute you. (LAUGHTER) Everybody else I know has. So, the notion that once you have lied once, you are condemned to an endless chain of lies-- there's a lot of us in that category.

Secondly, in-- in my view, there is no ethical principle being transgressed here. That is, I am in favor of kids getting the best education. It's not zero sum. I'm not bumping some other kid.

But, I would say this to—to Dallin, it's a very reasonable point. My guess is that the penalty for having misrepresented your kid's address is simply that the kid has to go back to the original school. So, I would say, yeah. I'm willing to say on this non-sworn application the kids lives here.

YOEST: But, this-- there is a direct line between Billy Bob who is-- who had to lie to get into the-- a particular school to Jason who lied on his application. (OVERTALK)

CROUCH: No, it's not. No, it's not.

OGLETREE: Rabbi Zemel, why is not the same--

CROUCH: We need a rabbi today.

ZEMEL: I think there's no ethical obligation to follow the rules of a system that's immoral. The system itself is immoral. The parents' obligation is to their child. And-- and-- and you're-- and you're-- you're-- you're teaching your child a lesson about—(OVERTALK) about what morality really is. That the higher value is the system is corrupt. And, we want to provide education for everybody.

TOENSING: (OVERTALK) So, it's okay to lie if you think you-

ZEMEL: And, I-- and I would lie again. I would lie all the way to advance the education of this child until I couldn't-- what are they, gonna put me jail?

YOEST: So, dress up your kid. Give 'em a sign and-- and-- and picket out in front of the school.

ZEMEL: That's not ch-- (OVERTALK) the picketing is not changing the school that I'm sending my kid to. The picketing isn't doing anything.

OGLETREE: Charmaine, you're not gonna do this, right?

YOEST: No, I'm not.

OGLETREE: Because it's wrong.

YOEST: And, I'm torn. I'm very torn.

OGLETREE: But, you're not gonna do it.

YOEST: No, I'm not.

OGLETREE: In-- in the same sense, 'cause you're concerned about a rule being broken here.

YOEST: Right, right.

OGLETREE: And, you happen to live in a-- take you away from it. You live in a neighborhood-- where you happen to know that there is someone-- who is using an address of someone in your neighborhood. And, therefore, they're going to a better school. Your school, where your child's going. So, you're gonna turn them in, right?

YOEST: I'm gonna go talk to them first and tell them what I think--

OGLETREE: Talk to me.

YOEST: Yeah, look, you are doing the wrong thing. You are teaching your children to lie in the school. And, you're putting me in a horrible position because my children don't have the opportunity to go to that school and it's wrong what you're doing.

OGLETREE: My child's going to this school. And, it's none of your business.

YOEST: It is my business 'cause you're hurting my children. You're hurting the whole system.

OGLETREE: Are you going to turn this person in who happens to have a fake address, who's going to a better school to save his-- his child's educational experience? You're gonna go to the principal and say, "Hey, the Smiths, that kid is from another neighborhood."

YOEST: I'm torn on that one. I'm really torn on that one. Probably-- probably not.

OGLETREE: Well, maybe I need to go to Victoria because she will. Right, Victoria?

(LAUGHTER)

TOENSING: No.

OGLETREE: It's wrong! The rules are broken, right? We've got to have some standards here, right?

MOORE: The issue's not the rules.

TOENSING: It's not-- it's--

MOORE: The issue's the-- the--

OGLETREE: Will you turn this family in?

MOORE: No, I don't see an obligation to that. That's a very different situation than my actively lying on behalf of my child. Now, if--

TOENSING: And, teaching your child to lie, which is to me--

MOORE: (OVERTALK) And, teaching my child to lie. Exactly right.

TOENSING: --the bigger-- the bigger deal.

OGLETREE: And so, your answer is the same?

TOENSING: I would have a very hard time deciding to turn somebody else in on that. I certainly couldn't do it right away. I would struggle with that.

OGLETREE: And, you've done that. And now, is the moment.

TOENSING: I'm not doin' it yet. Inaction is action.

OGLETREE: Okay. Let-- let me go to Uncle Barney. Remember your good buddy Chris? When you-- didn't have a job and your good friend Chris-- actually took your application to the job, put it on the top of the pile.

He also put in a great word with his boss about you. He didn't know whether you were qualified or not. But, he told you what the boss was gonna ask in the interview. And, you got the job.

And, the good news is that it turned out that you did a great job. Such a good job that you've surpassed Chris.

And now-- you have an important decision to make because you have to decide who's gonna get a promotion in this company. And, Chris is one of the applicants for that promotion. Is he qualified? Absolutely. Is he the best candidate? No. There's someone better. Do you recommend Chris for the job?

FRANK: Well, I hope I won't. I'm a human being. And, I have these personal feelings of gratitude. But, I do not have the obligation primarily to Chris. I have the obligation to the company.

If there is someone who is clearly better than Chris, I will have to recommend that person and accept the consequences of Chris's anger. I will understand if Chris will be disappointed. But, I-- I-- I think one of the great problems in society is when people put personal loyalty ahead of loyalty to the institution because the institution often represents the greater good.

OGLETREE: Where--this is very close. Chris is qualified, but there's somebody that's better.
But, it's close.

FRANK: But, if someone else can do it better--

OGLETREE: (OVERTALK) There's somebody who can do it a little better.

FRANK: If someone can do it b-- a little bit better, and it does not have any noticeable consequences on third parties, I have to tell you being human-- I-- I-- I guess I would put it this way: The likelihood in this case is that I probably would have persuaded myself that Chris and the other person were even. And, I would recognize--

OGLETREE: You'd nudge a little bit.

FRANK: But, if I-- if I could not make that rationalization, than I would appoint the other person and accept the consequences.

OGLETREE: Elayne Bennett, that's what friends are for, right?

BENNETT: I think you have to go with the best qualified person. I think if we keep equivocating all the time, and obviously we've all had these situations-- I would, if-- if-- if there was another applicant better than Chris, and I knew that, even if it was a little bit better, I would have to go for the other applicant.

OGLETREE: So, what does friendship mean?

BENNETT: Friendship's important, but-- but--

OGLETREE: (OVERTALK) A good friend.

BENNETT: --we're-- we're talking here about ethics. We're talking about honesty. We're talking about not lying. I think if you start equivocating with, okay, let's help a little bit with the essay. Let's change the address. Let's push the son of the friend when there's someone else more qualified, you know, it's-- where are we?

RODGERS: Well, but I got situational ethics quite frankly because I had no problem whatsoever accepting Chris's help when I got the job initially. I had no problem gettin' the questions ahead of time. I had no problem with him putting my name on the top of the list. All of a sudden, now that I'm in the position of power, now all of a sudden I have ethics? I don't think so.

BENNETT: Well, we do-- (OVERTALK) if there's another-- if there's another-- applicant who's more qualified than Chris and you know that--

RODGERS: Yeah, but you know what? There--

BENNETT: How can you push Chris?

RODGERS: There were other applicants probably who would've been more qualified than me for the job if it hadn't been for the fact that-- (OVERTALK)

OGLETREE: Indeed there were applicants more qualified than you. And, Chris helped you through. Vince?

PASSARO: I-- I think-- I can be no lover of institutions. And you're saying he's qualified. And, he got me this job. And, he pulled strings. And, my career has been made. And, he's my friend. I-- the institution is a pale ghost compared to those kinds of obligations.

ALLEN: What is this-- this quid pro quo conception of friendship come from? So, your friend does you a favor. You do your friend a favor back and forth, back and forth. This is an easy case to me because I think a true friend would respect my decision whether it was to give him the job, or to give the job to somebody else.

ZEMEL: On the other hand, objective-- criteria are rarely as objective as-- as we're saying there are. But in the business world, in all kinds of areas, this-- this notion of there are these objective criteria that are quantifiable and measurable in such an accurate way-- i-- is-- it doesn't exist.

RODGERS: There's the theoretical discussion here. But, there is the reality of what goes on in this world all the time. And, I think part of what is difficult for us in our personal ethics is to what de-- degree do we hold ourselves to a standard far higher than the standard we see operational in this country on a day to day basis?

And, I think part of what becomes difficult is that we have disadvantaged populations who never even get to know Chris. Who never get to know the Chris's of the world to be able to get the answers to the questions so that when they go into the door, of course there is the appearance of being less qualified because they don't have access to those who have access and then can't advance their careers. This absolutely is a common practice. You'll never convince me that it's not.

OGLETREE: So, as--

RODGERS: And, I think we justify in our head--

OGLETREE: (OVERTALK) you would-- you would appoint me.

RODGERS: Absolutely. And, I would not-- I would not say to myself at all that I'm doing it because you're my friend. That is why I really would be doing it. But, you are loyal. I

know you--

OGLETREE: So, I come in--

RODGERS: We could be a great team.

OGLETREE: Well, come in and tell me I'm gettin' a job.

RODGERS: Chris, you're gettin' a job.

OGLETREE: That's great. I knew I was the best. I knew absolutely there was no one better than me.

RODGERS: That's right.

OGLETREE: And, thanks, Denise, because I deserve it.

RODGERS: You're welcome.

OGLETREE: Great.

PASSARO: Well-- (LAUGHTER) if a--

OGLETREE: Whatcha mean, whoa?

PASSARO: Well, I-- I just want you to know, Chris, it was tough. It was tough. It was--

OGLETREE: Well, fine. I know it's tough, but I'm the best. You know, I'm--

PASSARO: Bob--

OGLETREE: I just want to make sure I got it on my merits, that's all. I know Vince, that's very important to you. It's very important to me.

FRANK: Chris, does the phrase "quit when you're ahead" have any meaning to you?
(LAUGHTER)

RODGERS: (UNINTEL) I'm gonna acknowledge-- I'm absolutely gonna acknowledge that you got it on your merits because if I don't, then I have to burst the bubble that's going on in my head that--

OGLETREE: Are you telling a little lie then?

RODGERS: Well, no I'm not because-- (OVERTALK) --you see the truth of the matter is--

OGLETREE: I'm saying yes and no. Yes and no. Barney?

FRANK: Well, she's lying to herself by (UNINTEL)-- lying is, you know, lying is kind of something everybody does in my experience at some level. And, this includes lying to yourself.

OGLETREE: Let me go to Professor Anita Allen. You-- live in a wonderful neighborhood. And, you have a new neighbor across the street. His name is Neil. Neil comes to you-- one day and says, "Hello, neighbor. Good to meet you."

ALLEN: Hi, neighbor.

OGLETREE: Hi. I'd like to ask you a small favor. My garage is broken. And, I have one of my

colleagues coming over to work with me this afternoon. I've got my car in the driveway and yours is empty. Do you mind if my-- colleague parks-- in your driveway this afternoon?

ALLEN: Fine, no problem.

OGLETREE: Okay, great, great. And, the-- the neighbor calls several times. And, you happen to notice, that my colleague is a very attractive young woman. And, that she always seems to come in the afternoon. And, she always seems to leave before-- Neil's wife gets home. So I call you. Hey, Anita, how you doin'?

ALLEN: Hi there.

OGLETREE: I'm gonna use the-- door-- the driveway today. No problem?

ALLEN: Well, you know, this is-- this is-- it's-- it's-- I was very happy to-- to welcome you to the neighborhood. And, I hope you enjoyed that pie and that pasta I gave you. But, I'm starting to feel a little bit-- like-- I need my driveway back.

OGLETREE: What's the problem?

ALLEN: Well-- I-- I-- you know, I—I often have people coming to the house who are-- handyman-- handymen or handywomen and painters. And-- and-- and my housekeeper and my-- my kids' friends. Their parents' cars and the carpool and I-- I'm beginning to as if-- that-- that my-- my-- my driveway cannot become a permanent parking lot for you.

OGLETREE: I think I'm hearing a flat out lie.

ALLEN: You are. (LAUGHTER)

OGLETREE: What are you struggling with?

ALLEN: I'm struggling with-- not wanting to be a total--a moralistic, Puritanical nerd. On the other hand, not wanting to-- facilitate something that might put me in a awkward position vis à vis-- the spouse or the partner of my new neighbor. I want to be friends with my-- both-- both partners in that household.

OGLETREE: Elayne Bennett, what would you do? What-- what would you do this neighbor? Would you have a conversation?

BENNETT: I would-- I would not have the qualms with saying-- how does your wife feel about this person who's parking in my driveway? And, that I-- I'm beginning to get a little uncomfortable--

OGLETREE: Oh-- oh, that's a good que-- it's my colleague.

BENNETT: Oh-- but, is-- I know it's your colleague. But, is your wife aware your colleague comes in the afternoons and needs a parking place--

OGLETREE: Are you trying to get in my personal life because I'm asking--

BENNETT: Well, but it-- you're-- you're in my personal--

OGLETREE: --to park a car in your driveway?

BENNETT: --life now because you're using my driveway.

CHARLES OGLETREE: So, what are you accusing me of?

BENNETT: I'm not accusing you. I'm just saying does your-- is your wife comfortable with the fact your colleague comes in the afternoon and needs to use my driveway?

OGLETREE: Yes.

BENNETT: If she's comfortable--

OGLETREE: End of discussion?

BENNETT: End of discussion.

CROUCH: What about the fact that you might not feel like being drafted into a situation? That's the thing I don't like. If you do it, you're in it.

OGLETREE: I'm Neil. What do you say to me when I ask the third time.

CROUCH: I'd just say, "Look, man, have your fun without my assistance."

OGLETREE: I'm just asking for a place to park.

CROUCH: (OVERTALK) No, I understand. But, there-- no, you ain't askin' for that. You're asking for something that I don't understand and I don't want to understand.

OGLETREE: What are you talkin' about?

CROUCH: I got the impression that this girl who comes over here is comin' in your house and taking her clothes off, and you're doing something with her, and I don't want to be a part of it.

OGLETREE: Wait a minute. Wait-- just because she's--

YOEST: (OVERTALK) Just because she's a-- an attractive woman? I think that's--

OGLETREE: Charmaine, talk to him.

YOEST: This is what's troubling me is he has a colleague who's an attractive woman. And now, you're taking this parking space away that you were willing to extend. I think you want to-- I like asking some questions. Like, "Oh, tell me more about your business. What do you do? What does your colleague do?"

CROUCH: The first thing is you have to be addlepatated to not be able to tell at a certain point if a man and a woman are not doing something besides business.

MOORE: So, no man can work with--

CROUCH: No, I didn't say that.

OGLETREE: Reverend Moore, what would you say to Neil?

MOORE: I would say to him, my wife would be very uncomfortable with my being alone in a house with a female colleague in the afternoon--

CROUCH: Who's good looking.

MOORE: --with ever-- without my wife being present.

OGLETREE: Well, that says something about you. Not about me.

MOORE: Well, I know. But, I would say, you know, if I'm-- if I'm giving you my driveway and if it does appear, as-- as Stanley said, as appear that there is something going on there, I would say, "You know, can you explain a little bit more about this?" Not in an accusatory way.

I agree with Charmaine. I would just in a neighborly way say this would really be problematic in my marriage. What does your wife think about this?

OGLETREE: Charmaine, he's not using the driveway anymore, but the colleague still comes by. And, Wednesday you happen to notice-- that Neil brazenly right in front of the house very warmly kisses this young colleague in a very passionate way.

ZEMEL: She finally finished Jason's college application essay-- (LAUGHTER)

OGLETREE: So, Charmaine, what do you do?

YOEST: Neil!

OGLETREE: Yes.

YOEST: Hi.

OGLETREE: How are you?

YOEST: I haven't had a chance to meet your colleague who's been parking in my driveway.

OGLETREE: Yeah, this is Carol.

YOEST: And, I would walk up and I would meet Carol. And, we'd all have a nice conversation.

And then, I would-- when I saw the-- the-- spouse and my-- who I'm sure is my friend by now, I would say, "Yeah, I ran into Neil and his beautiful colleague Carol the other day."
(OVERTALK)

ALLEN: Ooh, you're mean. (LAUGHTER)

OGLETREE: Randy, what do you think about that?

COHEN: You-- you have an-- an obligation not to abet what-- what-- that which you disapprove you. What you see as-- as immoral conduct. But, you don't have a duty to report it to other people. Once-- once they're canoodling you have no obligation to-- to approach the wife. Even in your cunning little way.

OGLETREE: Everybody in the neighborhood knows except Nina.

COHEN: You don't know what Nina knows.

OGLETREE: Who's gonna tell--

COHEN: You don't know what Nina knows.

OGLETREE: I'm tellin' you, Nina doesn't know.

FEMALE VOICE: Well--

OGLETREE: Nina doesn't know.

TOENSING: Nina may not want to know.

CONWAY: Nina may not want to know, exactly.

OGLETREE: Well, so are you going to tell her?

TOENSING: No.

CONWAY: No.

OGLETREE: You're not gonna tell her?

TOENSING: No, because I think Nina may not-- may have an accommodation. You don't, I have no idea about this.

OGLETREE: Let me ask you, Anita Allen, what would you do?

ALLEN: Until and unless I had developed a close personal friendship with her, I wouldn't tell her about the apparent affair. And, I wouldn't do it because I would be afraid that I might be inserting myself into a situation that I wasn't able to handle. There's a responsibility which comes from disclosure. What if Nina has a-- what if she has a mental health problem? What if she has-- an agreement with her husband? You never know what you're getting into when you insert yourself. And, a responsibility comes with that.

OGLETREE: No one thinks that -- Nina has a right to know from any of these nosy neighbors?

CROUCH: I think she has the right--

OGLETREE: Reverend Moore? (OVERTALK)

MOORE: I would tell her.

OGLETREE: What would you tell her?

MOORE: If-- if I'm present and I see her husband kissing this woman, I'm going to say, look, Nina. This-- this is not any of my business except that I was present in the neighborhood and I feel an obligation morally to let you know what's taking place here. You can do with it what you will. But, I think there may be something going on.

OGLETREE: Persuade Randy Cohen that you're right.

COHEN: (UNINTEL PHRASE) and I don't thank you for destroying my marriage. You force me (OVERTALK) No. That's not so. We've been go-- going along this way for many years. He's a great father.

MOORE: Well, then-- then you can continue—

COHEN: I choose to live this--

MOORE: --to go along this way.

COHEN: No, because you forced a confrontation on something we were handling in a different way. That we chose to make our own accommodations. We chose-- I-- I was able to not see him, preserve my dignity. Preserve my respect for him.

MOORE: Well, then-- well, then your husband shouldn't be kissing the woman on the front lawn.

COHEN: It's not for you to say, you neighborly busybody. (LAUGHTER)

MOORE: Well, it is for me--

COHEN: It is not. When you said it's none of my business—

MOORE: As my neighbor--

COHEN: --you were right.

MOORE: I-- I've already been in this because your-- your husband has been having his lover park in my driveway.

OGLETREE: Dallin Oaks, let me ask you this-- want to step back a moment. And, in fact-- Neil and Nina are not married. But, they're engaged to be married. (OVERTALK) She's his fiancée. And-- she's out working everyday paying all the bills while Neil is supposedly working-- on this novel. Are you gonna tell Nina?

OAKS: I-- I don't think I would. I don't think she has a right to call upon all the information about Neil's life that-- that may be out there among neighbors or employers or friends or former employers. I think if she's getting ready to marry the man, she has a responsibility to inquire. And, I don't feel the duty to come forward.

OGLETREE: Reverend Moore, he's right, right?

MOORE: No. I would-- if-- if I'm living in a-- in a neighborhood with these people, and I know this woman is about to make a-- what appears to be a horrible mistake, I'm going to let her know. Look, there may be some legitimate explanation. I can't think of what it might be. But, this was taking place on your front lawn. I think you need to know that as you're trying to make this decision--

OGLETREE: Let's see if your wife agrees with you.

TOENSING: I think we need to talk. (LAUGHTER) Look, why are you insinuating yourself into that relationship? We hardly know them. They just moved in. And now, you're gonna get over there and you may-- you may ruin something that they-- they have some kind of an agreement, an accommodation. We need to stay out of this.

MOORE: I think if they have an agreement and an accommodation, her knowledge of this is not going to ruin that accommodation.

TOENSING: You're posting your morals on them. It's enough-

MOORE: No, I-- no--

TOENSING: --for us to live our own--

MOORE: No, I'm giving them-- I'm giving them information. I'm giving her information about what is going on--

TOENSING: But, you give her information about when he gets his gas pumped?

MOORE: I would if I-- I would if he were a cheat. If he were cheating me out of money, and she's about to-- she's about to marry-- someone who's a-- who's a cheat, yes I would.

CONWAY: Could you tell me please, why-- why do you--

OGLETREE: I-- I think the two of you are gonna need some marriage counseling.
(LAUGHTER) Jill, tell me what you're thinking about this. What would you do?

CONWAY: Well, I-- I'm interested that a number of people seem to feel that the sexual behavior and conduct of their neighbors is their business. And, I do not think it is. I think that-- I may observe all sorts of strange behavior among the people who live near and around me. But, I-- I see no responsibility-- to intrude myself and my judgment of what I think their relationship should be. I would leave it to them.

OGELTREE: If she really can't get any information but from you, it won't come from you under any circumstances.

CONWAY: No, it will not.

BENNETT: It would come from me.

OGLETREE: All right, tell me why.

BENNETT: I-- I-- I've been thinking about it. I-- I like your husband right over here.

TOENSING: Watch it. (LAUGHTER)

BENNETT: I like him. I like his attitude. But, I'm also worried about my 13-year-old daughter who sees the gorgeous woman having the passionate kiss with Nina's fiancé. I'm worried about what she's--

TOENSING: Why don't you talk to the fiancé then? Don't mess us up and get us involved in this. Go talk to the fi-- to the-- to the--

BENNETT: To-- to the-- to the creep that's--

TOENSING: To the creep and say look—

ENNETT: First, and actually-- Mr. Good Husband, it would be a nice thing to say, you know, we know. We see—

MOORE: Absolutely. I agree.

BENNETT: And, our children see. And, we don't like that.

MOORE: Right.

BENNETT: And take it inside.

YOEST: I want to respond to your question about why it's our business to care about their marriage per se. And, it's because as a society we have-- we take marriage vows in public.

MOORE: That's right.

YOEST: And, there's a reason we do that. It's because the community is involved in the marriage. And, you take those vows in front of an assembled congregation. In many traditions we say, "Does anyone here have any reason why these two should not come together?" And, the community has a vested interest in the marriage. In each and every marriage.

OGLETREE: I'm gonna change a few facts for you. Neil and Nina are relatively new to the neighborhood. They're married now. They actually have two children. They go to the same school as your children attend.

And, Neil's still cheating on Nina. But now, he's running to become president of the

Parent Teacher Association, the PTA. So, the question, neighbors, assembled here. Will you vote for Neil? Who's the most qualified candidate. He's done fund raising before. Let me finish the hypothetical! Already rejecting Neil.

TOENSING: You're not qualified.

OGLETREE: Will you vote for him?

TOENSING: No.

OGLETREE: Why?

FRANK: Not if he's going against Chris.

TOENSING: Because-- (LAUGHTER)

PASSARO: Neil's a novelist. He can't have jobs like that. I'm sorry.

TOENSING: Because--

OGLETREE: He's still trying to publish that book.

TOENSING: --by your actions, you are not qualified, Neil.

MOORE: My wife and I are actually growing closer together now. (LAUGHTER) Yes, if he's running to be president of the Parent Teacher Association, he's publicly disrespecting his wife. He-- he's-- he's not keeping his marriage vows. I'm not going to vote for him.

OGLETREE: He's a great fund raiser. He's done the newsletter. He's-- every time someone

needed time, he's been the parent out there--

YOEST: He's a cheater.

MOORE: That's right.

OGLETREE: So, no, you wouldn't vote for him.

YOEST: He's a cheater.

RODGERS: You know, what's interest-- interesting to me--

OGLETREE: Denise?

RODGERS: --is whether or not he kissed her on the lawn or not, okay? So-- so, if I knew that he was having an affair, but I didn't know it because he was publicly flaunting it, which I consider kissing on the lawn, but-- but, I had-- and so, I knew a friend of the girlfriend, for example, who let me know that they were having this affair, I actually would not have any problem with him being the head of the PTA.

TOENSING: You mean, if he cheats well? If he cheats--

RODGERS: Yeah.

TOENSING: If he cheats well it's acceptable?

RODGERS: Yeah, exactly. So-- (OVERTALK) if he cheats well, then that's his personal life and I--

OGLETREE: And, you'll vote for him.

RODGERS: --don't-- and I don't think that has anything to do with his ability to be head of the PTA or not.

OGLETREE: Jill?

CONWAY: I agree totally with that point of view. We have-- no foundation to believe that a man who raises money for the school, is available to meet all the particular needs of the Parent Teacher Association will do any better or-- or worse job at that because he's having an affair. If we really think that-- people's sexual behavior should dis-allow them from performing other kinds of public service, we would have a very small cadre of people who perform public service. (LAUGHTER)

OGLETREE: Barney Frank?

FRANK: I would not take the-- that-- a discrete affair into account in a lot of elections. But, with regard to a-- the parent teacher, there is a peculiarly familial nexus there that I-- and I think I would say to him, this is not a good idea. Why-- why don't you run for city council where this-- (LAUGHTER)

TOENSING: Or Congress. Or Congress.

OGLETREE: Rabbi Zemel? Easy question?

ZEMEL: I feel if I know, everybody knows. It's not a secret. I-- I don't have secret information. I'm not a spy. Everybody in the community knows. I don't think we want representing as our PTA president someone who's violating a p-- basic parental responsibility as president of the PTA.

COHEN: I don't agree at all. His responsibility is not to be a paragon of what you regard as the right kind of marriage. His responsibility is to do the specific jobs called for in the PTA. (OVERTALK) That-- that people can have wonderful marriages and have affairs. Millions of people do. And, if he can do the job, he should have the job.

TOENSING: Then you get to vote for him.

FRANK: You're asking me as a voter is this something I would take into consideration? And yeah, it is something I would take into consideration.

RODGERS: I think that it's a very slippery slope that we're going down here, particularly with this representation of the-- of the PTA, of-- of sort of family values and that sort of thing. Because I think we go into a very-- so should-- should divorced parents not be able to be head of-- of the PTA?

FRANK: Well, gay parents should--

RODGERS: Should-- should gay parents not be able to be head of--

FRANK: It's not a slippery slope at all.

OGLETREE: I'm one of the potential voter about to vote for this, and-- and you're a good-- friend of mine. You're gonna support-- Neil, right? He seems the best candidate. He's got my vote. He's got yours too, right?

BENNETT: No, I'm not voting for him.

OGLETREE: Why not?

BENNETT: I'm not voting for him for personal reasons. I-- I don't think he's the right guy for this job.

OGLETREE: Everything I've heard about him--

BENNETT: The right person for this job.

OGLETREE: --he's qualified. He's worked hard. He's raised money. He's there for the parents and the--

BENNETT: It appears that he has these qualifications. But, I think there are some other aspects to being-- head of the PTA. And I don't think Neil meets the qualifications.

OGLETREE: All right, I'd love to hear that because I'm a voter. What do you know that I don't know?

BENNETT: I'm not at liberty to share that particular component of Neil.

OGLETREE: Oh my God. Has he committed a crime?

BENNETT: --of Neil. No. He's not committed a crime. He's not someone I'm gonna vote for though.

FRANK: Get a life. It's the PTA.

OGLETREE: Is anyone who's going to vote for another candidate other than Neil going to tell the uninformed neighbor? Reverend Moore?

MOORE: I'm not going to, no.

OGLETREE: Why not?

MOORE: No, unless it-- unless it's a-- a reasonably public event, I'm not going to be part of a-- a gossip campaign against him.

MOORE: I'm simply gonna do exactly what Elayne did.

ALLEN: He's gonna out the fiancé to the girlfriend and out the husband to the wife, but you're not gonna tell your neighbor a little bit of gossip that might help that person understand why you're not gonna vote a certain way?

MOORE: No, (UNINTEL PHRASE) the same level of responsibility. I-- I don't think that-- I don't think that-- that my responsibility to the wife who's having a-- a marriage-- she's being disrespected. She's being-- she's having her marital vows violated. It's a very different situation than my informing you about what I have heard about-- about a potential candidate. I'm simply going to say, "I'm not voting for this person."

OGLETREE: And-- and-- Stanley, you're not gonna tell either?

CROUCH: Yeah, I would tell. (LAUGHTER)

OGLETREE: I thought I had two votes.

CROUCH: Yeah, I would tell--

OGLETREE: What-- what are you gonna tell me?

CROUCH: Well, the-- the reason--

CHARLES OGLETREE: Why are you not voting for Neil?

CROUCH: I would say-- because he's playing on his wife. And, I think-- that in-- in-- in our time particularly, that's an extraordinarily dangerous thing.

BENNETT: (OVERTALK) I respect Stanley for that.

OGLETREE: Charmaine?

BENNETT: I respect your opinion.

YOEST: Barney makes an excellent point. The PTA campaign is going to be very unusual. And, there's going to be a lot coffee, kitchen table conversations. And, if it's a very good friend of mine, I have a responsibility to share information that I have about someone. And, to me, the fact that someone is cheating on their marriage vows is relevant to public office.

OGLETREE: Well, speaking of relevant- Elder Dallin Oaks, how do we make these decisions and think it through? Looking back at all the things we've been grappling with today?

OAKS: In certain kinds of offices whether a person keeps their promises, whether they tell lies, big ones or small ones, are extremely important to me. There are other kinds of offices for which I-- don't consider it so important. In any event, I would be very reluctant to spread gossip. And, it would take a very important kind of office for me to tip over into repeating what I'd heard, have you heard, and so on.

OGLETREE: Professor Anita Allen, when is personal life ever relevant?

ALLEN: It's always, it's always relevant. The question is what does its relevance call upon us to do? I think the personal morals have a lot to do with how we in fact structure our schools and our families and our communities. And so, to pretend it's not there is not, not very-- very helpful. But, I do think that we have to give people some privacy. And, that to always assume that the best thing to do to is to-- to blab, to tell, to-- to talk to, interfere is wrong.

COHEN: What underpins this I think is the notion that there's something called character. And, that the glimpse we're given into someone's character through their personal conduct reveals something about a consistent pattern of behavior into the future in their public life.

And-- and, the more I've had my cushy job, the less I've come to think that's true. That I think the way we behave is more profoundly shaped by the circumstances we find ourselves in. The kind of society we live in. The kind of social justice we encounter or not.

That what we call notions of character often don't correlate in this way. And-- and it's-- it's a-- a word we use to disguise our lack of knowledge. And-- and, a kind of prejudice.

YOEST: No, they-- can I--

OAKS: I disagree with that. I-- I think there is a-- there is a bright line of truth-telling and promise-keeping that-- that comes out of the deep roots of a person, and makes their conduct predictable across a wide range of activities, whether in public or in private life. It's not an invariable test. But, it's the best one I know.

OGELTREE: Let me ask Jill. When are personal life issues ever relevant?

CONWAY: I do believe that American society is so obsessed about people's sexual conduct that

it is invasive in all sorts of ways about people's personal sexual life, which we have absolutely no evidence from any kind of social science research in any way affects how they behave under-- other res-- positions of responsibility.

OGLETREE: And, let me finally ask you-- Rabbi Zemel, when is a person's personal life or behavior ever relevant to you when you think about issues of ethics?

ZEMEL: Well, I-- I agree that-- person's personal sex life is-- is-- has become way too public. But, I think character is-- is critical. I-- I think-- who a person is and what their life is about and-- and what they believe is-- is how we get to know a person and what a person really is-- underpins them.

OGLETREE: Well, what-- what we have done, I think, is-- with this discussion today is to have all of you tell us that these personal ethical issues are complex. They're painful. They're conflicting. They're difficult sometimes to understand. But, they are things that we have to discuss and grapple with. And, you as a panel has done that in an excellent and professional way. Thank you all for being with us today. (APPLAUSE)

VOICEOVER: Ethics in America is a presentation of the Fred Friendly Seminars at the Columbia University Graduate School of Journalism. Fred Friendly Seminars is solely responsible for its content.

ANNENBERG VO: Annenberg Media. For information about this and other Annenberg Media programs call 1-800-LEARNER and visit us at www.learner.org.

END OF TRANSCRIPT